LOUGHTON TOWN COUNCIL

PLANNING AND LICENSING COMMITTEE

MINUTES of the Meeting held on Monday 6 September 2021 at 7.45pm at Loughton Library & Town Hall

Committee Members:

Councillors: T Downing (in the Chair)

P Abraham	C Davies	S Murphy
K Rainbow	J Riley	G Wiskin

Also in attendance: S Murray

Officers: Debra Paris (Planning Committee Clerk)

13 Members of the public.

PL55 Apologies for Absence

No apologies for absence were received for this meeting.

PL56 Declarations of Interest

Cllr Wiskin declared a non-pecuniary interest in planning application EPF/1816/21, 58 Traps Hill, as he was a close neighbour to this property.

The Committee declared a non-pecuniary interest in planning applications : EPF/1586/21 – Highgrove Close; EPF/1817/21 – 30 Algers Road; EPF/1851/21 – 37 Hanson Drive; EPF/2024/21 – Valley Hill, Valley Close; EPF/2196/21 & EPF/2028/21 – The Gardeners Arms, 103 York Hill and EPF/2197/21 - The Gardeners Arms, 103 York Hill; EPF/2039/21 - 23 Newnham Close and EPF/2123/21 – The Chestnuts, Ollards Grove, owing to comments received from the LRA Plans Group.

Cllr Murray declared a non-pecuniary and non-prejudicial interest in these proceedings. He was only in attendance at this meeting in respect of planning application EPF/2024/21, Valley Hill, Valley Close. This proposal fell within his ward and he therefore had an interest, having been copied into over 20 letters of objection from residents. Cllr Murray stated that as a Member of Area Plans South at District level, he would not speak, or remain for any other items, so as not to fetter his ability to consider any Plans South matters.

PL57 Confirmation of Minutes

The Minutes of the meeting of the Planning and Licensing Committee held on 16 August 2021 were CONFIRMED as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

The Committee AGREED to bring forward the following planning applications as members of the public were interested in these items.

PL58 Planning Applications

The following planning applications were CONSIDERED, and the plans inspected.

58.1 Application No: EPF/1586/21 Officer: lan Ansell Applicant Name: Mr S Tappenden Planning File No: 002742
Location: Highgrove Close, formerly land to the rear of 33-37 Hillyfields, Loughton, IG10 2PT
Proposal: Construction of a 4 bedroom two storey dwelling with associated parking and landscaping.
The Committee NOTED the contents of two letters of objection.

A member of the public with an interest in this item addressed the meeting.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application stating it was an overdevelopment of the site which would be overbearing on the amenity of residents in neighbouring properties on both Coteford Close and Highgrove Close.

Members requested that the soft landscaping, on the site of this proposal, which was conditioned in the approved application EPF/2193/16 should be enforced.

The Committee drew the attention of the Tree and Landscaping Officer to the Arboricultural Report submitted for this application which it believed was incorrect and that the proposed development would negatively impact the willow tree in the garden of the neighbour at 3 Coteford Close.

Furthermore, the additional property was contrary to the SAC and would result in more car pollution and a subsequent impact on the air quality to the SAC. This proposal would also result in more pressure for the overstressed recreational services and subsequent damage to the SAC.

The current proposed solution to bring in a Clean Air Zone (CAZ) in 2025 is not guaranteed to happen and has not yet been approved by the Planning Inspector. In any event the proposal does not stop additional cars associated with new dwellings from polluting the SAC before the CAZ is brought into operation.

Application No: EPF/2024/21 Officer: Alastair Prince Applicant Name: CK Hutchison Networks (UK) Ltd Planning File No: 002778 Location: Valley Hill, Valley Close, Loughton, IG10 3BF Proposal: Application for proposed telecommunications installation: 'slim line' phase 8 monopole c/w wraparound cabinet at base, 3no. additional ancillary equipment cabinets & associated ancillary works. The Committee NOTED the contents of 18 letters of objection and one letter of support.

A member of the public with an interest in this item addressed the meeting.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application stating this was an inappropriate site for the proposed mast which would be highly visible from the flats of Valley Lodge and other residences. The mast and cabinets would further add street clutter to this residential road causing a detrimental effect on the street scene.

Members noted that an existing mast was located only a short distance from the proposed site, at the junction of Valley Road and Roding Road, and questioned why the applicants could not mast share? No arboricultural report had been submitted with this proposal to show whether a root survey had been undertaken, and members believed the installation would seriously impact on the adjacent street tree. The Committee drew the Planning Officer's attention to the Tree & Landscaping Officer's report, in this regard, indicating this application was contrary to policy LL10 and DM5 (Submission version of EFDC Local Plan (Dec 2017)).

Cllr Murray left the meeting.

The Committee AGREED to deal with the following applications together as they were for the same site.

Application No: EPF/2028/21 Officer: Zara Seelig Applicant Name: Mr Joseph Weeks Planning File No: 010401 Location: The Gardeners Arms, 103 York Hill, Loughton, IG10 7RX Proposal: Grade II Listed Building application for proposed new fencing, including hedge removal (retrospective), provision of patio (retrospective) and proposed refurbishment of veranda around outbuilding. The Committee NOTED the contents of two letters of objection.

A member of the public with an interest in this item addressed the meeting.

Members deplored the retrospective nature of this application.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application on the grounds that the loss of hedging and replacement with two metre close boarded fencing was detrimental to the setting of the late 17th Century listed building and this part of the York Hill Conservation Area.

Members believed it should be removed and the hedging replaced, or a more appropriate boundary treatment agreed, particularly due to the close proximity of the Forest, and in order to protect its wildlife and habitats. It was brought to Members' attention that bats had been nesting in the removed hedging.

The veranda should be replaced like for like; replacing the original brick piers for oak timber piers was harmful to the special interest of the listed building, and this part of the York Hill Conservation Area.

The height of the proposed replacement veranda was excessive and would result in a negative visual impact and a loss of privacy to the residents of neighbouring properties in York Hill and Pump Hill. It would also lead to noise pollution for residents of neighbouring properties.

The Committee believed that the creation of the patio for use as a beer garden and veranda should also require a change of use application, which was not mentioned in this proposal. Members understood that a noise abatement notice had been issued and enforcement action imposed to prevent this use.

Members noted a picket fence had been erected to the front but did not form part of any of the applications submitted. This had been put up in breach of the Article 4 direction for York Hill. The Committee requested that the council's planning enforcement team investigate this issue too. Finally, the Committee noted that the position of the planning notices in respect of these planning applications, EPF/2028/21, EPF/2196/21 and EPF/2197/21 were not well presented and expressed concern as to why the proposals had not been submitted under one application.

Application No: EPF/2196/21 Officer: Zara Seelig Applicant Name: Mr Joseph Weeks Planning File No: 010401 Location: The Gardeners Arms, 103 York Hill, Loughton, IG10 7RX Proposal: Application for proposed new fencing, including hedge removal (retrospective), provision of patio (retrospective) and proposed refurbishment of veranda around outbuilding. The Committee NOTED the contents of two letters of objection.

A member of the public with an interest in this item addressed the meeting.

Members deplored the retrospective nature of this application.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application on the grounds that the loss of hedging and replacement with two metre close boarded fencing was detrimental to the setting of the late 17th Century listed building and this part of the York Hill Conservation Area.

Members believed it should be removed and the hedging replaced, or a more appropriate boundary treatment agreed, particularly due to the close proximity of the Forest, and in order to protect its wildlife and habitats. It was brought to Members' attention that bats had been nesting in the removed hedging.

The veranda should be replaced like for like; replacing the original brick piers for oak timber piers was harmful to the special interest of the listed building, and this part of the York Hill Conservation Area.

The height of the proposed replacement veranda was excessive and would result in a negative visual impact and a loss of privacy to the residents of neighbouring properties in York Hill and Pump Hill. It would also lead to noise pollution for residents of neighbouring properties.

The Committee believed that the creation of the patio for use as a beer garden and veranda should also require a change of use application, which was not mentioned in this proposal. Members understood that a noise abatement notice had been issued and enforcement action imposed to prevent this use.

Members noted a picket fence had been erected to the front but did not form part of any of the applications submitted. This had been put up in breach of the Article 4 direction for York Hill. The Committee requested that the council's planning enforcement team investigate this issue too.

Finally, the Committee noted that the position of the planning notices in respect of these planning applications, EPF/2028/21, EPF/2196/21 and EPF/2197/21 were not well presented and expressed concern as to why the proposals had not been submitted under one application.

Application No: EPF/2197/21 Officer: Zara Seelig Applicant Name: Mr Joseph Weeks Planning File No: 010401 Location: The Gardeners Arms, 103 York Hill, Loughton, IG10 7RX Proposal: Grade II Listed Building application for DJ booth (retrospective), proposed repairs and reglazing of windows and doors to 14mm double glazed panes, repair and paint, proposed insulation of building including cladding repair and paint.

The Committee NOTED the contents of two letters of objection.

A member of the public with an interest in this item addressed the meeting.

Members deplored the retrospective nature of this application.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application stating the raised DJ booth by reason of its size, shape and materials would have a detrimental impact on the planform of the room and the special interest of the listed building. The harm was substantial and there were no public benefits to offset this harm. Members requested it therefore be removed and the room restored to its original planform.

The Committee requested a condition ensuring any replacement materials matched the existing in respect of any repair works, where the council considers listed building consent was required.

Finally, the Committee noted that the position of the planning notices in respect of these planning applications, EPF/2028/21, EPF/2196/21 and EPF/2197/21 were not well presented and expressed concern as to why the proposals had not been submitted under one application.

PL59 Matters for Report

59.1 Application for a Pavement Licence: The Ginger Pig, 165A High Road, Loughton, IG10 4LF

The Committee RATIFIED the following comments, submitted under powers of delegated authority, in order to meet the required deadline, in respect of an application for the above pavement licence.

The Committee's comments were:

The Planning and Licensing Committee OBJECTED to this application on the grounds that it is already far too congested outside this shop, with customers queuing, on what is an extremely busy corner. Patron's constantly pull up in their vehicles parking on the pavement. To add tables and chairs would exacerbate an existing hazard for the safety of pedestrians passing by.

Members also commented that this establishment is a butcher's shop, not a licensed café, and it would be unfair to other licensed cafes within the High Road.

These comments are submitted under powers of delegated authority, to meet the deadline for this application.

59.2 Amended Plans

59.2.1 EPF/1703/21 - 22 Grosvenor Drive, Loughton, IG10 2LH Proposal: Proposed ground floor front & side extension. **Amended plans** – Min no PL34.1

The Planning Committee Clerk reported that notification of these amended plans had been received shortly after the agenda for this meeting had been distributed. Comments were required for this proposal by 14 September 2021, before the next Planning and Licensing Committee meeting on 21 September 2021.

The amended plans were inspected. Members considered nothing had changed from the previous plans and commented that the drawings remained unclear.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application, reiterating its previous comments which were:

"The Committee OBJECTED to this application on the grounds of the extra bulk, detailed design, loss of the gap with next door, and the subsequent loss of a parking space."

Members requested that should the local planning authority be minded to approve this application, that a condition be imposed that the extension remain ancillary to the main dwelling.

PL60 Planning Applications

The following planning applications were CONSIDERED, and the plans inspected. **60.1** Application No: EPF/1816/21

Officer: Muhammad Rahman Applicant Name: Mr Raheshchandra Patel Planning File No: 020155 Location: 58 Traps Hill, Loughton, IG10 1TD Proposal: Application for a Lawful Development certificate for an existing outbuilding in rear garden.

Members deplored the retrospective nature of this application.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application stating the plans submitted were unclear. No sizes were provided on the drawings and the purpose of the building was not indicated.

Application No: EPF/1817/21 Officer: Alastair Prince Applicant Name: Mr John Shelley Planning File No: 021134 Location: 30 Algers Road, Loughton, IG10 4NG Proposal: Double storey side, single storey rear extension. The Committee NOTED the contents of two letters of objection.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application. The site formed part of a pair of unique period semi-detached dwellings that remained largely untouched.

The proposal would have a deleterious effect on the street scene, creating a terracing effect. The extent of the side extension was too dominant and

overbearing, resulting in a sense of enclosure for the neighbour and affecting their amenity.

Members were also concerned at the potential loss of access to the drains for the neighbouring properties at nos 28 and 26 Algers Road, which could be impacted by this proposal.

If the local planning authority was minded to approve this application, members requested that the side extension should be set back to maintain symmetry with no 32 and away from the boundary to allow light to no 28. It should not protrude further than no 32.

Application No: EPF/1851/21 Officer: Muhammad Rahman Applicant Name: Mr Todor Boiadjiev Planning File No: 008163 Location: 37 Hanson Drive, Loughton, IG10 2EF Proposal: Raise the existing roof ridge line and construct a loft conversion with a rear dormer and three front roof windows. The Committee NOTED the contents of a letter of objection.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application stating the raising of the roof was out of proportion to the neighbouring property and would be exacerbated as the road goes downhill. The dormer was too prominent and should be set much further back. It was requested that the brick on edge and tile corbel verge detail should be maintained.

Members believed this proposal, if approved, would set an unacceptable precedent.

Application No: EPF/1860/21 Officer: Kie Farrell Applicant Name: Phillip Preston Planning File No: 031175 Location: 42 Woodland Road, Loughton, IG10 1HJ Proposal: Two storey rear extension and front porch extension.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application. Members commented on the poor drawings provided, in particular the poor quality and lack of detail to the existing and proposed floor plans. It was not possible to ascertain the number of extra bedrooms proposed.

Application No: EPF/1899/21 Officer: Alastair Prince Applicant Name: Nitika Arya Planning File No: 031281 Location: 1 Aragon Close, Loughton, IG10 3NP Proposal: Partial garage conversion and proposed porch enclosure.

The Committee had NO OBJECTION to this application.

Application No: EPF/1982/21 Officer: Brendan Meade Applicant Name: Mr Matt Richardson Planning File No: 031292 Location: 9 Felstead Road, Loughton, IG10 3AZ **Proposal:** Proposed small log cabin / summerhouse on temporary decking at the bottom of the garden.

The Committee had NO OBJECTION to this application.

Members requested that should the local planning authority be minded to approve this application, that a condition be imposed that the proposal remain ancillary to the main dwelling.

Application No: EPF/2018/21 Officer: David Maguire Applicant Name: Mr Paul Tyrrell Planning File No: 005916 Location: 40 The Avenue, Loughton, IG10 4PX Proposal: Proposed single storey rear extension & part first floor rear extension.

The Committee had NO OBJECTION to this application.

Application No: EPF/2022/21 Officer: Alastair Prince Applicant Name: Mr Peter Fairweather Planning File No: 008852 Location: 25 Roundmead Close, Loughton, IG10 1QD Proposal: Front porch extension.

The Committee had NO OBJECTION to this application.

Application No: EPF/2030/21 Officer: Muhammad Rahman Applicant Name: Mrs Jane Musgrove Planning File No: 003813 Location: Crown House, Media 10 Ltd, 151 High Road, Loughton, IG10 4LF Proposal: Retrospective change of use of 3 parking bays to outside seating area.

Members deplored the retrospective nature of this application.

The Committee had NO OBJECTION to this application.

Application No: EPF/2039/21 Officer: Brendan Meade Applicant Name: Mr Paul Cooper Planning File No: 011934 Location: 23 Newnham Close, Loughton, IG10 4JG Proposal: Part two storey and part single storey side extension, part two storey and part single storey rear extension, loft conversion with rear dormer, and 3 roof lights to front roof slopes. (Amended application to EPF/0734/21).

The Committee NOTED the contents of a letter of objection.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application, stating it was an overdevelopment. The gable roof to the extension and the increase in size of the rear dormer added too much bulk to the dwelling, spoiling the symmetry with no 24, resulting in a detrimental effect on the street scene.

Application No: EPF/2065/21 Officer: Ian Ansell Applicant Name: Mr David Shternzis Planning File No: 012629 Location: The Mount, 213 High Road, Loughton, IG10 1BB Proposal: Construction of first floor roof terrace to two flats at front of building and alterations to two windows to create 'French' doors to allow access onto roof terrace.

The Committee had NO OBJECTION to this application.

Application No: EPF/2097/21 Officer: Kie Farrell Applicant Name: Mr Stuart Ballard Planning File No: 030419 Location: 68 Church Hill, Loughton, IG10 1LB Proposal: Retention of a raised patio and side screen. Erected in agreement with No.66 Church Hill to prevent overlooking into rear garden.

Members deplored the retrospective nature of this application.

The Committee reiterated its previous comments to planning application EPF/1602/21, (Min no PL26.1) which were:

The Committee had NO OBJECTION to this application based on the neighbour's agreement to this proposal.

Application No: EPF/2123/21 Officer: Marie-Claire Tovey Applicant Name: Cyntra Property Holdings Ltd Planning File No: 031012 Location: The Chestnuts, Ollards Grove, Loughton, IG10 4DL Proposal: Application for Prior Approval of a proposed new dwellinghouses on detached blocks of flats. The Committee NOTED the contents of a letter of objection.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application on the following grounds:

The building was a complete composition that was never designed to hold an extra floor which would, by reason of the extra height and bulk be detrimental to the external appearance of the building and this part of Ollards Grove.

The lack of parking and subsequent impact on the area. Two additional flats meant there would be eight in total with only five spaces. The new flats were for three persons with two bedrooms. Accordingly, they would likely be occupied by couples or couples with a child, rather than by single, younger people and thus, although there were good transport facilities, there would be less justification for reducing the County Council recommended parking provision than would be the case if the flats were smaller.

The proposed development was contrary to the SAC and would result in more car pollution and a subsequent impact on the air quality to the SAC. This proposal would also result in more pressure for the overstressed recreational services and subsequent damage to the SAC.

The current proposed solution to bring in a Clean Air Zone (CAZ) in 2025 is not guaranteed to happen and has not yet been approved by the Planning Inspector. In any event the proposal does not stop additional cars associated with new dwellings from polluting the SAC before the CAZ is brought into operation.

60.2 Deemed Permission – provided for information only: The Committee NOTED the following applications: Application No: EPF/2084/21 Officer: Alastair Prince Applicant Name: Mr Danvir Sagoo Planning File No: 014639 Location: 65 Audley Gardens, Loughton, IG10 2EW Proposal: Application for a Lawful Development certificate for a proposed single storey rear extension & porch.

> Application No: EPF/2087/21 Officer: David Maguire Applicant Name: Peter Stedman Planning File No: 023125 Location: 10 Tewkesbury Close, Loughton, IG10 3NT Proposal: Application for a Lawful Development certificate for a proposed loft conversion with two front skylights.

- 60.3 Others provided for information only: EPF/2094/21, EPF/2101/21, EPF/2130/21, and EPF/2340/21 The Committee NOTED the information received from Epping Forest District Council.
- **Decisions** No Planning Decisions from Epping Forest District Council had been received.
- PL62 Licensing Applications No licensing applications had come to the attention of officers.

PL63 Enforcement and Compliance

PL61

63.1 The Planning Committee Clerk advised that notification had been received that an officer had been assigned to investigate the breach reported in respect of the replacement windows at first floor level at 179 – 181 High Road, Loughton.

Signed: Date: 21 September 2021