THESE MINUTES NOT YET CONFIRMED LOUGHTON TOWN COUNCIL

PLANNING AND LICENSING COMMITTEE

MINUTES of the Meeting held on Monday 21 November 2022 at 7.30pm at Loughton Library & Town Hall

Committee Members:

Councillors:	W Kauffman (in the Chair)		
	P Abraham J Riley	S Murphy G Wiskin	K Rainbow
Officare	Dobro Paris (Planning Committee Clark)		

Officers: Debra Paris (Planning Committee Clerk) Jonathon Glynn (Finance Officer)

3 Members of the public.

Cllr Kauffman welcomed those present and advised that he would be Chairing this evening's meeting.

PL305 Apologies for Absence

The Planning Committee Clerk reported that Cllr Davies had sent her apologies for absence for this meeting.

PL306 Declarations of Interest

The Committee declared a non-pecuniary interest in the following planning applications:

- EPF/0974/22 127 High Road; EPF/1546/22 47 Harwater Drive; EPF/2398/22 26 Ladyfields; EPF/2475/22 40 Church Lane; and EPF/2487/22 87 Grosvenor Drive, owing to comments received from the LRA Plans Group; and
- II. EPF/2480/22 112 Borders Lane, as the application site is next to The Murray Hall, which is owned by Loughton Town Council.

Cllr Kauffman declared a non-pecuniary interest in planning application EPF/2475/22 – 40 Church Lane, as his parents are neighbours of this property. He advised he would therefore leave the meeting when the Committee considered this application.

The Committee elected Cllr Murphy to take the Chair when this planning application was considered.

PL307 Confirmation of Minutes

The Minutes of the meeting of the Planning and Licensing Committee held on 21 November 2022 were CONFIRMED as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

The Committee AGREED to bring forward planning application EPF/2475/22 – 40 Church Lane, as members of the public present at the meeting had an interest in this item.

Cllr Kauffman left the meeting for the following item.

PL308 Planning Application

308.1 Application No: EPF/2475/22

Officer: Muhammad Rahman

Location: 40 Church Lane, Loughton, IG10 1PD **Proposal:** Demolition of existing Bungalow and the erection of 2No Detached Dwelling Houses.

The Committee NOTED the contents of three letters of objection. A member of the public with an interest in this application addressed the meeting.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application stating it would be a serious overdevelopment of the site and out of character, resulting in a negative impact on the street scene.

Members noted that no Arboricultural Impact Statement had been provided and expressed concern for the loss of the attractive trees and greenery to the frontage of this property. The Committee drew the attention of the Planning Officer to the Tree & Landscaping Officer's holding objection in respect of this application.

This part of Church Lane is characterised by large houses that are well set back with substantial gardens to the rear. The existing bungalow does not have such a large rear garden. Members understand that much of the original garden now formed part of No 2 Hill Top Place; thus reducing the development options for the bungalow. Squeezing in two houses would be out of character with the area.

The proposed two dwellings are pushed forward of the building line, which would be unacceptable and impact heavily on the setting of No 42 Church Lane.

The loss of this bungalow would reduce housing choice, particularly for people with disabilities, which is contrary to the council's policy on mixed and balanced communities.

The proposed houses were poorly designed, lacking character, and were much inferior to the adjacent residences. They would be out of keeping and detrimental to the special character and architectural interest of Church Lane. The proposed three storey houses would result in direct overlooking into the garden and rear windows to No 2 Hill Top Place, which sits to the rear, much closer than any of the other dwellings to this part of the rear of Church Lane. Their privacy and setting are protected by reason of the existing building being a bungalow. The proposal would be overpowering to the occupiers of No 2 Hill Top Place.

The proposed extra property on this site would place extra stress on the EF SAC. Natural England and Loughton Town Council have both advised in their main modifications responses to the Inspector (autumn 2021) that the LPSV cannot yet be considered justified, effective or consistent with national policy in relation to detriment to the SAC. Therefore, we **object to this application** because of the urbanisation effect, burden on recreational pressure, and damage to air quality in the SAC that the application, alone or with other projects, will engender.

Finally, the Committee supported the comments of the LRA Plans Group regarding the "principle of demolishing the dwelling and embedded carbon", and the effects on climate change that result.

Cllr Kauffman returned to the room and resumed the Chair for the remainder of the meeting.

PL309 Matters for Report

309.1 Planning Re-consultation

309.1.1 EPF/2278/22 – 8 Alderton Hall Lane, Loughton, IG10 3HJ.

Proposal: Construction of new boundary fencing *AMENDED PLANS* – Min no PL292.1

The Committee considered the amended plans that had been provided, but upheld its original OBJECTION, which was:

"The Committee NOTED the contents of a letter of objection.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application stating it completely changes the street scene and character of the road.

Whilst this proposal was an improvement on the previous refusal, this property (on the corner of Alderton Rise) and the houses across Alderton Rise on Alderton Hall Lane up to the junction with Alderton Hill all have open frontages (or did until this fence was erected).

They form an attractive open area with Alderton Rise, where the front gardens are also all open. The boundary fencing, by reason of its height and prominence was out of character and detrimental to the openness of the area. Whilst acknowledging the property adjacent on Greenfields has boundary treatment to edge of pavement, this was part of that street, and the fencing on 8 Alderton Hall Lane amounted to a creeping erosion which was not justified in townscape terms."

309.2 Enforcement Notice Appeal

309.2.1 179-181 High Road, Loughton, IG10 4LF. Proposal: Without planning permission the installation of an extraction system onto rear elevations of the property (Appeal Ref: APP/J1535/C/22/3308500) – Min No PL292.1

The Committee reiterated its original OBJECTION to this proposal – Min no. PL292.1, which was:

"The Committee NOTED the contents of a letter of objection.

Members deplored the retrospective nature of this application.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application stating the plant was enormous and unsightly, and had resulted in a negative impact on the street scene and neighbours' amenity.

Members considered the extraction system should be located on the middle of the roof, hidden from view, as it was previously. Cafe Rouge was able to operate without such large plant and the Committee could see no reason for plant this large. Concern was expressed that this was to facilitate the unauthorised extensions which have been added to the rear of the restaurant without planning permission, and which are the subject of Enforcement Notice ENF/00003/22. Members expressed support for the removal of the unauthorized rear structure. The Committee requested planning officers investigate what is authorised on the site and check the drawings do not include alterations that do not have consent. Members urged the council to take enforcement action if there was any evidence the plant was disturbing neighbours, and issue a stop notice should that be the case."

PL310 Tree Preservation Order TPO/EPF/07/22: 240 Chester Road, Loughton, Essex, IG10 2LR

The Committee NOTED the information received from Epping Forest District Council in respect of this matter.

PL311 Planning Applications

The following planning applications were CONSIDERED, and the plans inspected.

- **311.1 Application No:** EPF/0974/22
 - Officer: Marie-Claire Tovey

Location: 127 High Road, Loughton, IG10 4LT

Proposal: Change of use of rear section of ground floor retail unit and upper floors offices to five residential dwellings, construction of two and a half storey rear extension, alterations to roof and associated works. The Committee NOTED the contents of a letter of objection.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application on the grounds that this proposal was a serious overdevelopment of the site with inadequate plans.

The layout and spacing of the residential accommodation were very poor. Bedroom 2 on the ground floor was considered substandard, the daylight levels to the kitchen of the ground and second floor flats was unacceptable. The bedroom to the front Second Floor unit had no natural daylight.

As the refuse bins were facing the High Road, there should be an enclosure for the bins and recycling materials.

The application site was next to a bus stop and nursery school, and was in a very busy location, with parents dropping off and collecting children. The additional vehicles that this proposal would attract would lead to highway safety issues. Members noted that no parking provision had been provided for residents, visitors, or deliveries.

The loss of retail floorspace would impact on viability of the retail unit. Members objected to the loss of the employment space.

The proposed extra dwellings on this site would place extra stress on the EF SAC. Natural England and Loughton Town Council have both advised in their main modifications responses to the Inspector (autumn 2021) that the LPSV cannot yet be considered justified, effective or consistent with national policy in relation to detriment to the SAC. Therefore, we **object to this application** because of the urbanisation effect, burden on recreational pressure, and damage to air quality in the SAC that the application, alone or with other projects, will engender.

The Committee also understands that this property was previously used as a petrol filling station, so the land was likely to be contaminated. A ground condition report should be requested to ensure it was fit for residential use. Application No: EPF/1546/22 Officer: Alastair Prince Location: 47 Harwater Drive, Loughton, IG10 1LP Proposal: Proposed ground floor side and rear extension and first floor side extension. The Committee NOTED the contents of a letter of objection.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application stating the proposed extension would close the gap on No 45, resulting in a detrimental impact on the street scene creating a terracing effect. The character of semidetached houses with a reasonable gap between the dwellings should be preserved. The proposed front fenestration was out of keeping.

The thin long ground floor rear extension was too long (5.1m), eating into the garden and should be reduced.

Members noted the plans mentioned the approval for a loft extension, however, the stairs to the loft were not shown. The drawings should show everything.

Application No: EPF/2398/22 Officer: Muhammad Rahman Location: 26 Ladyfields, Loughton, IG10 3RP Proposal: Erection of new one bedroom, two person, two storey dwelling attached to the existing house. The Committee NOTED the contents of a letter of objection.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application stating it was an attractively laid area around the road junction, which would be seriously visually disrupted.

The bulge in the side of the proposed dwelling was out of character with the area and imbalanced the terrace. Due to the odd shape of the building and roof the rainwater flowing down, the roof would require ugly sloping gutters or guides to stop the water cascading over the boundary.

The garden to the new dwelling was too small.

The proposed extra property on this site would place extra stress on the EF SAC. Natural England and Loughton Town Council have both advised in their main modifications responses to the Inspector (autumn 2021) that the LPSV cannot yet be considered justified, effective or consistent with national policy in relation to detriment to the SAC. Therefore, we **object to this application** because of the urbanisation effect, burden on recreational pressure, and damage to air quality in the SAC that the application, alone or with other projects, will engender.

Application No: EPF/2450/22 Officer: Loredana Ciavucco Location: 89 Whitehills Road, Loughton, IG10 1TU Proposal: Hardstanding & Vehicle Crossover

The Committee OBJECTED to this application on the grounds that the houses in this part of Loughton were all characterised by attractive front gardens. The proposed removal of the garden would have a negative impact on the street scene. Members considered the existing single crossover to be sufficient for this property and that the existing wall should be retained.

The Committee also noted that the proposed material for the hardstanding was tarmac, a non-permeable surface which would increase water run-off. It should be a permeable surface.

Application No: EPF/2480/22 Officer: Caroline Brown Location: 112 Borders Lane, Loughton, IG10 3SB Proposal: Erection of single storey rear extension, two storey side extension and loft conversion with rear dormer window.

The Committee had NO OBJECTION to this application.

However, members requested that should the local planning authority be minded to approve this application a condition be imposed that the house is adequately sound proofed to maintain the amenity of the residents from the neighbouring Murray Hall next door, which is used for day and evening functions throughout the week.

Application No: EPF/2487/22

Officer: Rhian Thorley Location: 87 Grosvenor Drive, Loughton IG10 2LA **Proposal:** Proposed first floor extension above existing rear ground floor extension & loft conversion, including x2 no. roof light windows in existing front pitched roof.

The Committee NOTED the contents of a letter of objection.

The Committee OBJECTED to this application on the grounds that the proposed extensions by reason of their height and bulk represented an over development of the site. From the front it would appear out of character as all the pairs of semis on this side of the road had the same balanced shape. From the gardens of numbers 85 and 89 it would loom very large.

The existing dwelling was attractively designed. This overbearing proposal was totally out of character with the area and would result in an unacceptable increased sense of enclosure to the adjoining neighbours.

Application No: EPF/2489/22 Officer: Robin Hellier Location: 8 Grange Court, Loughton, IG10 4QX Proposal: TPO/EPF/40/88 (Ref: A1) T1: Sycamore - Crown reduce by 3m, as specified.

The Committee objects to applications which will result in inappropriate treatment being carried out to any significant tree, and also objects to any application to fell such a protected tree. It therefore objected to this application.

If, however, the District Council's arboricultural officers deem this application acceptable, whether with amendments or not, then the Committee was willing to waive its objection.

Application No: EPF/2516/22 Officer: Robin Hellier **Location:** 1 Woodbury Hill, Loughton, IG10 1JB **Proposal:** TPO/CHI/02/68/A1 Tree A & Tree B: 2 x Oaks - Crown reduce, as specified. Tree C: Pine - Crown reduce, as specified.

The Committee objects to applications which will result in inappropriate treatment being carried out to any significant tree, and also objects to any application to fell such a protected tree. It therefore objected to this application.

If, however, the District Council's arboricultural officers deem this application acceptable, whether with amendments or not, then the Committee was willing to waive its objection.

Members expressed concern for the negative effect of this proposal on the Conservation Area characterised by these mature elegant trees.

311.2 Deemed Permission – provided for information only:

The Committee NOTED the following applications: **Application No:** EPF/2393/22 **Officer:** Alastair Prince **Location:** 59 Felstead Road, Loughton, IG10 3BB **Proposal:** Application for a Lawful Development certificate for a proposed loft conversion.

Application No: EPF/2444/22 Officer: Marie-Claire Tovey Location: 4 Tycehurst Hill, Loughton, IG10 1BU Proposal: Certificate of lawful development for a proposed hip to gable loft extension and rear dormer window in connection with a loft conversion.

311.3 Others – provided for information only: EPF/2506/22, EPF/2521/22 and EPF/2555/22

The Committee NOTED the information received from Epping Forest District Council.

PL312 Decisions

312.1 Decisions by Epping Forest District Council

The Committee NOTED the decisions for October 2022.

PL313 Licensing Applications

No licensing applications had come to the attention of officers.

PL314 Enforcement and Compliance

314.1 No reports had been received.

Signed: Date: 5 December 2022